## APPENDIX A – OPTION APPRAISAL TABLES

### Issue 1 - AIM / VISION

Is the AIM / VISION of the JMWDPD Appropriate?

- It is recognised that there are limited opportunities for the extraction of primary minerals, but that the nature of construction work over the plan period will help promote the use of secondary and recycled materials. The Tees Valley will contribute to the national, regional and local requirements for minerals by ensuring minerals are used, managed and extracted in a manner which drives mineral use up the minerals hierarchy, with opportunities for the processing and use of secondary and recycled minerals being maximised;
- A modern waste management industry is in place, which provides an adequate provision of facilities which are driving waste management up the waste hierarchy. Advantage will be taken of the opportunities presented to the waste management industry for education, training, employment, innovation and the symbiotic relationship with other environmental industries, which arise from the nature of the existing industries and available land in the Tees Valley;
- Minerals and waste related developments will be provided in a sustainable manner which contributes to the Tees Valley being a place where present and future generations have a high quality of life and where all members of the community have the opportunity to realise their full potential, though the provision of a vibrant economy, a safe and healthy environment and dynamic educational and cultural resources.

						Timescale		Commentary / Explanation
	Proposed	I SA Objectives	Appraisal	Criteria	Short Term	Medium Term	Long Term	(to include cumulative and synergistic effects as well as the differential
					(2010-2014)	(2014-2021)	(2021 – beyond)	effects on urban/rural environment)
	C. C. Same	1. To move up the minerals	Will it reduce mineral of	consumption?				Bullet point 1 of the vision explicitly seeks to establish that minerals are extracted, managed and consumed in a manner which drives mineral use up the hierarchy.
	100	hierarchy	Will it minimise minera	al sterilisation?		++	++	The assumption has been made that the document is taking cognisance of all mineral
			Will it increase the minerals?	e sales of secondary	++			usage not only 'construction minerals'.
			Will it provide an aggregates?	appropriate level of				
120 100		2. To move up the waste hierarchy	Will it divert materials away from landfill?					Bullet point 2 specifically relates to moving waste activity up the waste hierarchy in the Tees Valley. The vision explicitly seeks to promote education, innovation and symbiotic
trioured option	prevention		Will it increase the reu	se of materials?				relationships.
least Isycured option	recycling energy recovery disposal		Will it increase innovation     waste facilities?	tive in recycling and				
			Will it increase local re	ecycling rates?	++	++	++	
			Will it increase compo materials rates?	siting and soil making				
			Will it encourage the u waste technologies' w from recycling?					

## Is the AIM / VISION of the JMWDPD Appropriate?

- It is recognised that there are limited opportunities for the extraction of primary minerals, but that the nature of construction work over the plan period will help promote the use of secondary and recycled materials. The Tees Valley will contribute to the national, regional and local requirements for minerals by ensuring minerals are used, managed and extracted in a manner which drives mineral use up the minerals hierarchy, with opportunities for the processing and use of secondary and recycled minerals being maximised;
- A modern waste management industry is in place, which provides an adequate provision of facilities which are driving waste management up the waste hierarchy. Advantage will be taken of the opportunities presented to the waste management industry for education, training, employment, innovation and the symbiotic relationship with other environmental industries, which arise from the nature of the existing industries and available land in the Tees Valley;
- Minerals and waste related developments will be provided in a sustainable manner which contributes to the Tees Valley being a place where present and future generations have a high quality of life and where all members of the community have the opportunity to realise their full potential, though the provision of a vibrant economy, a safe and healthy environment and dynamic educational and cultural resources.

					Timescale		Commentary / Explanation
Proposed	Proposed SA Objectives		Appraisal Criteria	Short Term	Medium Term	Long Term	(to include cumulative and synergistic effects as well as the differential
				(2010-2014)	(2014-2021)	(2021 – beyond)	effects on urban/rural environment)
	3. To make better use of all resources	•	Will it reduce Ecological Footprint? Will it reduce energy consumption?				As noted above, sustainable consumption of minerals and re-use / recycling of materials are key aspirations of the vision.
The state		•	Will it increase the use of renewable and waste energy sources?  Will it make better use of local resources? (proximity principle)	0		++	Although links between the vision and Ecological Footprints, renewable energies and local resources are not explicit it is overall considered that 'innovation and provision of adequate facilities' will contribute towards this aspect of effective resource use. In addition it is noted that moving waste towards the top end of the hierarchy may actually decrease materials to the EfW plant.
			(proximity principle)	U	+		Overall a marginally positive scoring has been afforded given the overall thrust of the vision to move up the waste / minerals hierarchy and implicitly make better use of resources. It is considered that a shift in energy consumption and energy sources shall only be apparent in the medium to long term.
							It is considered that a significantly positive relationship will be established in the long term once the programmes and projects which shall underpin this policy document have been established and reaching maturity.
	4. To ensure good air quality for all	•	Will it maintain or improve dust, odour and emissions from minerals and waste facilities?  Will it reduce environmental degradation from the eight main air pollutants?				The vision is considered to marginally contribute towards this objective given its aim to implement modern and innovative industries which by nature are deemed to be less polluting. Furthermore, bullet point 3 specifically seeks to encourage 'sustainable' waste and minerals management. This is likely to entail symbiosis and reduction in road travel, both of which shall reduce production of air pollutants.
				0	+	+	Specific reference to reducing the need to transport minerals and waste products, especially by road would strengthen this relationship and establish a significantly positive scoring.
							<u>Recommendation</u>
							Emphasis should be placed on locating process industries close to minerals and waste sources (or bring sites) as well as explicitly promoting the use of rail and port facilities where transboundary movement of materials is required.
							The final line of bullet point 1 could be reworded to state:- 'The Tees Valley will contribute to the nationalwith opportunities for the processing and secondary and

Is the AIM / VISION of the JMWDPD Appropriate?

- It is recognised that there are limited opportunities for the extraction of primary minerals, but that the nature of construction work over the plan period will help promote the use of secondary and recycled materials. The Tees Valley will contribute to the national, regional and local requirements for minerals by ensuring minerals are used, managed and extracted in a manner which drives mineral use up the minerals hierarchy, with opportunities for the processing and use of secondary and recycled minerals being maximised;
- A modern waste management industry is in place, which provides an adequate provision of facilities which are driving waste management up the waste hierarchy. Advantage will be taken of the opportunities presented to the waste management industry for education, training, employment, innovation and the symbiotic relationship with other environmental industries, which arise from the nature of the existing industries and available land in the Tees Valley;
- Minerals and waste related developments will be provided in a sustainable manner which contributes to the Tees Valley being a place where present and future generations have a high quality of life and where all members of the community have the opportunity to realise their full potential, though the provision of a vibrant economy, a safe and healthy environment and dynamic educational and cultural resources.

	Appraisal Criteria		Timescale		Commentary / Explanation
Proposed SA Objectives		Short Term	Medium Term	Long Term	(to include cumulative and synergistic effects as well as the differential
		(2010-2014)	(2014-2021)	(2021 – beyond)	effects on urban/rural environment)
					recycled minerals being maximised <u>as close to source as feasible</u> .
					And
					Bullet point 3 may be strengthened by a the following re-emphasis:-
					'Minerals and waste related developments will be provided and located in a sustainable manner which contributes to the Tees Valley being a place where present and future generations have a high quality of life and where all members of the community have the opportunity to realise their full potential, through the provision of a vibrant economy, a safe and healthy environment and dynamic educational and cultural resources.  Further additions to this bullet point were closely considered but it was deemed that sustainable transport issues are adequately dealt with within the strategic objectives.
5. To protect and enhance the quality of the sub region's controlled waters?	Will it protect and enhance the quality of the sub region's controlled waters? (inland, ground, aquifer, coastal, bathing, rivers and sea waters)	0	+	+	A marginally positive scoring has been afforded given that bullet point 3 specifically relates to ensuring that the Tees Valley has a healthy environment.

Is the AIM / VISION of the JMWDPD Appropriate?

- It is recognised that there are limited opportunities for the extraction of primary minerals, but that the nature of construction work over the plan period will help promote the use of secondary and recycled materials. The Tees Valley will contribute to the national, regional and local requirements for minerals by ensuring minerals are used, managed and extracted in a manner which drives mineral use up the minerals hierarchy, with opportunities for the processing and use of secondary and recycled minerals being maximised;
- A modern waste management industry is in place, which provides an adequate provision of facilities which are driving waste management up the waste hierarchy. Advantage will be taken of the opportunities presented to the waste management industry for education, training, employment, innovation and the symbiotic relationship with other environmental industries, which arise from the nature of the existing industries and available land in the Tees Valley;
- Minerals and waste related developments will be provided in a sustainable manner which contributes to the Tees Valley being a place where present and future generations have a high quality of life and where all members of the community have the opportunity to realise their full potential, though the provision of a vibrant economy, a safe and healthy environment and dynamic educational and cultural resources.

			Timescale		Commentary / Explanation
Proposed SA Objectives	Appraisal Criteria	Short Term	Medium Term	Long Term	(to include cumulative and synergistic effects as well as the differential
		(2010-2014)	(2014-2021)	(2021 – beyond)	effects on urban/rural environment)
6. To protect and enhance the sub-region's biodiversity and geodiversity  •	<ul> <li>Will it protect SSSI's, SPA's and SAC's and other statutory designated sites?</li> <li>Are opportunities taken in operation and restoration of waste and minerals sites to enhance biodiversity?</li> <li>Will it protect non-statutory (local) designated sites?</li> <li>Will it take into consideration species and habitats?</li> </ul>	0	+	++	Similar to comments noted above. It is considered that bullet point 3 eludes to the protection of biodiversity and amending the wording of bullet point 2 may further bolster this positive scoring:-  **Recommendation**  Amend bullet point 2 to read:-  **A modern waste management industry is in place, which provides an adequate provision of facilities which are driving waste management up the waste hierarchy. Advantage will be taken of the opportunities presented to the waste management industry for education, training, employment, improving the environment innovation and the symbiotic relationship with other environmental industries, which arise from the nature of the existing industries and available land in the Tees Valley;  It is considered that a significantly positive relationship will be established in the long term once the programmes and projects which shall underpin this policy document to improve the environment have been established and reaching maturity.

Is the AIM / VISION of the JMWDPD Appropriate?

- It is recognised that there are limited opportunities for the extraction of primary minerals, but that the nature of construction work over the plan period will help promote the use of secondary and recycled materials. The Tees Valley will contribute to the national, regional and local requirements for minerals by ensuring minerals are used, managed and extracted in a manner which drives mineral use up the minerals hierarchy, with opportunities for the processing and use of secondary and recycled minerals being maximised;
- A modern waste management industry is in place, which provides an adequate provision of facilities which are driving waste management up the waste hierarchy. Advantage will be taken of the opportunities presented to the waste management industry for education, training, employment, innovation and the symbiotic relationship with other environmental industries, which arise from the nature of the existing industries and available land in the Tees Valley;
- Minerals and waste related developments will be provided in a sustainable manner which contributes to the Tees Valley being a place where present and future generations have a high quality of life and where all members of the community have the opportunity to realise their full potential, though the provision of a vibrant economy, a safe and healthy environment and dynamic educational and cultural resources.

				Timescale		Commentary / Explanation
Proposed	d SA Objectives	Appraisal Criteria	Short Term	Medium Term	Long Term	(to include cumulative and synergistic effects as well as the differential
			(2010-2014)	(2014-2021)	(2021 – beyond)	effects on urban/rural environment)
	7. To protect and enhance the quality and diversity of	Does it maintain and enhance landscape and townscape quality?				Considered that bullet point 3 contribute towards a positive scoring given that it seeks to develop a healthy environment. Discussions noted that mineral extraction has
	the rural and urban land and landscapes	Will it reduce greenfield development?				significant potential to disturb both rural and urban landscapes. To this extent amendments to bullet point have been suggested as follows:-
	ana lanaccapec	Will it increase remediation of contaminated land?				Recommendation
		land?	+	+	+	It is recognised that there are limited opportunities for the extraction of primary minerals, but that the nature of construction work over the plan period will help promote the use of secondary and recycled materials. The Tees Valley will contribute to the national, regional and local requirements for minerals by ensuring minerals are used, managed and extracted in a manner which drives mineral use up the minerals hierarchy, with opportunities for the processing and use of secondary and recycled minerals being maximised as close to source as feasible and without significant environmental degradation.;
	8. To protect and enhance the sub region's cultural heritage	Will it protect and enhance historic landscapes and features?      Will it preserve and enhance heritage settlements and buildings?	+	+	+	The recommended rewording of bullet points 1 and 2 along with the principle of bullet point 3 in relation to environmental protection contribute towards a positive scoring with this objective.

Is the AIM / VISION of the JMWDPD Appropriate?

- It is recognised that there are limited opportunities for the extraction of primary minerals, but that the nature of construction work over the plan period will help promote the use of secondary and recycled materials. The Tees Valley will contribute to the national, regional and local requirements for minerals by ensuring minerals are used, managed and extracted in a manner which drives mineral use up the minerals hierarchy, with opportunities for the processing and use of secondary and recycled minerals being maximised;
- A modern waste management industry is in place, which provides an adequate provision of facilities which are driving waste management up the waste hierarchy. Advantage will be taken of the opportunities presented to the waste management industry for education, training, employment, innovation and the symbiotic relationship with other environmental industries, which arise from the nature of the existing industries and available land in the Tees Valley;
- Minerals and waste related developments will be provided in a sustainable manner which contributes to the Tees Valley being a place where present and future generations have a high quality of life and where all members of the community have the opportunity to realise their full potential, though the provision of a vibrant economy, a safe and healthy environment and dynamic educational and cultural resources.

			Timescale		Commentary / Explanation
Proposed SA Objectives	Appraisal Criteria	Short Term	Medium Term	Long Term	(to include cumulative and synergistic effects as well as the differential
		(2010-2014)	(2014-2021)	(2021 – beyond)	effects on urban/rural environment)
9. To reduce the causes and impacts of climate change	Will it reduce emissions of greenhouse gases?				Similar to the comments noted under objective 4. Could be improved if further emphasis placed on proximity principal and use of alternative transport modes.
	Will it reduce imports and exports of materials?				
	Will it reduce flood risk?	X	+	+	
	Will it reduce the loss of coastal resources due to sea level rises?				
	Will it increase number of renewable projects taking place in the Tees Valley?				
10. To reduce crime	<ul> <li>Will it reduce fly tipping?</li> <li>Will it reduce the use of unlicensed sites?</li> <li>Will it increase the use of 'Designing out Crime' principles on waste and minerals facilities?</li> </ul>	+	+	+	Bullet points 2 and 3 clearly have social and environmetal connotations that seek to ensure that the Minerals and Waste DPD's shall contribute towards creating a safe and crime free environment. The reference to 'adequate provisions' for waste facilities under bullet point 2 should also reduce temptation to fly tip and use of unlicensed sites.

## Is the AIM / VISION of the JMWDPD Appropriate?

- It is recognised that there are limited opportunities for the extraction of primary minerals, but that the nature of construction work over the plan period will help promote the use of secondary and recycled materials. The Tees Valley will contribute to the national, regional and local requirements for minerals by ensuring minerals are used, managed and extracted in a manner which drives mineral use up the minerals hierarchy, with opportunities for the processing and use of secondary and recycled minerals being maximised;
- A modern waste management industry is in place, which provides an adequate provision of facilities which are driving waste management up the waste hierarchy. Advantage will be taken of the opportunities presented to the waste management industry for education, training, employment, innovation and the symbiotic relationship with other environmental industries, which arise from the nature of the existing industries and available land in the Tees Valley;
- Minerals and waste related developments will be provided in a sustainable manner which contributes to the Tees Valley being a place where present and future generations have a high quality of life and where all members of the community have the opportunity to realise their full potential, though the provision of a vibrant economy, a safe and healthy environment and dynamic educational and cultural resources.

				Timescale		Commentary / Explanation
Propose	d SA Objectives	Appraisal Criteria	Short Term	Medium Term	Long Term	(to include cumulative and synergistic effects as well as the differential
			(2010-2014)	(2014-2021)	(2021 – beyond)	effects on urban/rural environment)
	11. To improve and safeguard health and wellbeing while reducing inequalities in health	<ul> <li>Will it ensure that waste and minerals sites are appropriately managed in order to reduce social isolation?</li> <li>Will it increase the amount of recreational facilities and open space?</li> </ul>	0	0	+	It was noted that there were only tenuous links with the content of this policy document and health and well being issues. Notwithstanding this, bullet point 2 and 3 both clearly seek to improve employment opportunities, education and a general 'healthy environment'.  To this extent a marginally positive scoring has been afforded in the long term once specific projects stemming from this document can be noted.
	12. To ensure high and stable levels of employment and economic growth in the Tees Valley	unemployment in the sub region?	++	++	++	It is considered that the aims are aspirational and seek to stimulate economic growth, employment and education in the short term in both the minerals and waste sectors. Innovation and technology is clearly referenced as a strength and an opportunity to develop the Tees Valley as a market leader in the waste industry in particular.

Is the AIM / VISION of the JMWDPD Appropriate?

- It is recognised that there are limited opportunities for the extraction of primary minerals, but that the nature of construction work over the plan period will help promote the use of secondary and recycled materials. The Tees Valley will contribute to the national, regional and local requirements for minerals by ensuring minerals are used, managed and extracted in a manner which drives mineral use up the minerals hierarchy, with opportunities for the processing and use of secondary and recycled minerals being maximised;
- A modern waste management industry is in place, which provides an adequate provision of facilities which are driving waste management up the waste hierarchy. Advantage will be taken of the opportunities presented to the waste management industry for education, training, employment, innovation and the symbiotic relationship with other environmental industries, which arise from the nature of the existing industries and available land in the Tees Valley;
- Minerals and waste related developments will be provided in a sustainable manner which contributes to the Tees Valley being a place where present and future generations have a high quality of life and where all members of the community have the opportunity to realise their full potential, though the provision of a vibrant economy, a safe and healthy environment and dynamic educational and cultural resources.

				Timescale		Commentary / Explanation
Proposed	I SA Objectives	Appraisal Criteria	Short Term	Medium Term	Long Term	(to include cumulative and synergistic effects as well as the differential
			(2010-2014)	(2014-2021)	(2021 – beyond)	effects on urban/rural environment)
	13. To raise educational and training achievement across the sub region		+	++	++	Comments similar to those noted above. It is clear that innovation, technology and education are imbedded in the vision.
	14. To reduce the movement of materials and increase choice of transport mode		0	+	+	Bullet point 3 specifically seeks to encourage 'sustainable' waste and minerals management. This is likely to entail symbiosis and reduction in road travel.  Specific reference to reducing the need to transport minerals and waste products, especially by road would strengthen this relationship and establish a significantly positive scoring.  Recommendation  Emphasis should be placed on locating process industries close to minerals and waste sources (or bring sites) as well as explicitly promoting the use of rail and port facilities where transboundary movement of materials is required.  The final line of bullet point 1 could be reworded to state:- 'The Tees Valley will contribute to the nationalwith opportunities for the processing and secondary and recycled minerals being maximised as close to source as feasible.  And

Is the AIM / VISION of the JMWDPD Appropriate?

- It is recognised that there are limited opportunities for the extraction of primary minerals, but that the nature of construction work over the plan period will help promote the use of secondary and recycled materials. The Tees Valley will contribute to the national, regional and local requirements for minerals by ensuring minerals are used, managed and extracted in a manner which drives mineral use up the minerals hierarchy, with opportunities for the processing and use of secondary and recycled minerals being maximised;
- A modern waste management industry is in place, which provides an adequate provision of facilities which are driving waste management up the waste hierarchy. Advantage will be taken of the opportunities presented to the waste management industry for education, training, employment, innovation and the symbiotic relationship with other environmental industries, which arise from the nature of the existing industries and available land in the Tees Valley;
- Minerals and waste related developments will be provided in a sustainable manner which contributes to the Tees Valley being a place where present and future generations have a high quality of life and where all members of the community have the opportunity to realise their full potential, though the provision of a vibrant economy, a safe and healthy environment and dynamic educational and cultural resources.

			Timescale		Commentary / Explanation
Proposed SA Objectives	Appraisal Criteria	Short Term	Medium Term	Long Term	(to include cumulative and synergistic effects as well as the differential
		(2010-2014)	(2014-2021)	(2021 – beyond)	effects on urban/rural environment)
					Bullet point 3 may be strengthened by a the following re-emphasis:-
					'Minerals and waste related developments will be provided <u>and located</u> in a sustainable manner which contributes to the Tees Valley being a place where present and future generations have a high quality of life and where all members of the community have the opportunity to realise their full potential, through the provision of a vibrant economy, a safe and healthy environment and dynamic educational and cultural resources.
					Further additions to this bullet point were closely considered but it was deemed that sustainable transport issues are adequately dealt with within the strategic objectives.
15. Access to waste and minerals facilities	<ul> <li>Will it reduce the need to travel?</li> <li>Will it increase the number of Household Waste Recovery Centres in the Tees Valley?</li> <li>Will it increase 'kerbside recycling initiatives'</li> <li>Will it provide more facilities for small to medium enterprise?</li> </ul>	Х	+	++	Bullet point 2 specifically seeks to achieve the 'adequate provision' of waste facilities. It is likely these will be implemented in the long term.

Is the AIM / VISION of the JMWDPD Appropriate?

'In 2021, the Tees Valley will be a sub-region where:

- It is recognised that there are limited opportunities for the extraction of primary minerals, but that the nature of construction work over the plan period will help promote the use of secondary and recycled materials. The Tees Valley will contribute to the national, regional and local requirements for minerals by ensuring minerals are used, managed and extracted in a manner which drives mineral use up the minerals hierarchy, with opportunities for the processing and use of secondary and recycled minerals being maximised;
- A modern waste management industry is in place, which provides an adequate provision of facilities which are driving waste management up the waste hierarchy. Advantage will be taken of the opportunities presented to the waste management industry for education, training, employment, innovation and the symbiotic relationship with other environmental industries, which arise from the nature of the existing industries and available land in the Tees Valley;
- Minerals and waste related developments will be provided in a sustainable manner which contributes to the Tees Valley being a place where present and future generations have a high quality of life and where all members of the community have the opportunity to realise their full potential, though the provision of a vibrant economy, a safe and healthy environment and dynamic educational and cultural resources.

			Timescale		Commentary / Explanation
Proposed SA Objectives	Appraisal Criteria	Short Term	Medium Term	Long Term	(to include cumulative and synergistic effects as well as the differential
		(2010-2014)	(2014-2021)	(2021 – beyond)	effects on urban/rural environment)

#### Conclusions

The Aim / Vision scored marginally or significantly well against the majority of the sustainability criteria given its overarching and aspirational nature that seeks to establish a comprehensive minerals and waste sector in the sub region. There were no negative relationships identified although a number of minor wording changes could improve scoring and clarify matters.

#### Recommendations

Emphasis should be placed on locating process industries close to minerals and waste sources (or bring sites) as well as explicitly promoting the use of rail and port facilities where transboundary movement of materials is required.

#### The final line of bullet point 1 could be reworded to state:- '

It is recognised that there are limited opportunities for the extraction of primary minerals, but that the nature of construction work over the plan period will help promote the use of secondary and recycled materials. The Tees Valley will contribute to the national, regional and local requirements for minerals by ensuring minerals are used, managed and extracted in a manner which drives mineral use up the minerals hierarchy, with opportunities for the processing and use of secondary and recycled minerals being maximised as close to source as feasible and without significant environmental degradation.;

#### Amend bullet point 2 to read:-

A modern waste management industry is in place, which provides an adequate provision of facilities which are driving waste management up the waste hierarchy. Advantage will be taken of the opportunities presented to the waste management industry for education, training, employment, improving the environment, innovation and the symbiotic relationship with other environmental industries, which arise from the nature of the existing industries and available land in the Tees Valley;

#### Bullet point 3 may be strengthened by the following re-emphasis:-

'Minerals and waste related developments will be provided <u>and located</u> in a sustainable manner which contributes to the Tees Valley being a place where present and future generations have a high quality of life and where all members of the community have the opportunity to realise their full potential, through the provision of a vibrant economy, a safe and healthy environment and dynamic educational and cultural resources.

#### KEY



- 1. To reduce the impacts of development on the causes of climate change and the effects of climate change on development:
- 2. To make provision for the adequate and steady supply of the minerals needed by society, whilst driving minerals supply up the minerals hierarchy:
- 3. To safeguard minerals resources from unnecessary sterilisation:
- 4. To drive the management of all waste up the waste hierarchy, towards the minimisation of waste production:
- 5. To protect and enhance the environment, amenity and human health:
- 6. To promote the use of sustainable transport:
- 7. To provide sufficient waste management facilities in a timely and sustainable manner, in order for all waste to be managed as near as possible to its source:

				Timescale		Commentary / Explanation
Propose	d SA Objectives	Appraisal Criteria	Short Term	Medium Term	Long Term	(to include cumulative and synergistic effects as well as the differential
			(2010-2014)	(2014-2021)	(2021 – beyond)	effects on urban/rural environment)
A Comment of the Comm	1. To move up the minerals	Will it reduce mineral consumption?		++		Objective 3.2.2 specifically seeks to address this matter
	hierarchy	Will it minimise mineral sterilisation?			++	
P		Will it increase the sales of secondary minerals?	++			
		Will it provide an appropriate level of aggregates?				
10 M	2. To move up the waste hierarchy	Will it divert materials away from landfill?				Objective 3.2.4 specifically seeks to address this matter
most prevention prevention prevention minimation		Will it increase the reuse of materials?				
head sprund option are supplied to the supplied option opt		Will it increase innovative in recycling and waste facilities?				
		Will it increase local recycling rates?	++	++	++	
		Will it increase compositing and soil making materials rates?			***	
		Will it encourage the use of 'energy from waste technologies' where it doesn't detract from recycling?				

- 1. To reduce the impacts of development on the causes of climate change and the effects of climate change on development:
- 2. To make provision for the adequate and steady supply of the minerals needed by society, whilst driving minerals supply up the minerals hierarchy:
- 3. To safeguard minerals resources from unnecessary sterilisation:
- 4. To drive the management of all waste up the waste hierarchy, towards the minimisation of waste production:
- 5. To protect and enhance the environment, amenity and human health:
- 6. To promote the use of sustainable transport:
- 7. To provide sufficient waste management facilities in a timely and sustainable manner, in order for all waste to be managed as near as possible to its source:

					Timescale		Commentary / Explanation
Propose	Proposed SA Objectives		Appraisal Criteria	Short Term	Medium Term	Long Term	(to include cumulative and synergistic effects as well as the differential
				(2010-2014)	(2014-2021)	(2021 – beyond)	effects on urban/rural environment)
	3. To make better use of all	•	Will it reduce Ecological Footprint?				References contained within the climate change objective (3.2.1) and both hierarchy objectives seek to address the matter by the reuse and recycling of materials whilst
CASE AND DESCRIPTION OF THE PARTY OF THE PAR	resources	•	Will it reduce energy consumption?				reducing the requirement to travel between nodes.
White the		•	Will it increase the use of renewable and waste energy sources?				
		•	Will it make better use of local resources? (proximity principle)	+	+	+	
	4. To ensure good air	•	Will it maintain or improve dust, odour and emissions from minerals and waste facilities?				Objectives 3.2.6 and 3.2.7 both contribute towards a significantly positive relationship with this objective.
	quality for all	•	Will it reduce environmental degradation from the eight main air pollutants?				
				++	++	++	

# <u>Is sue 2 – OBJECTIVES</u>

- 1. To reduce the impacts of development on the causes of climate change and the effects of climate change on development:
- 2. To make provision for the adequate and steady supply of the minerals needed by society, whilst driving minerals supply up the minerals hierarchy:
- 3. To safeguard minerals resources from unnecessary sterilisation:
- 4. To drive the management of all waste up the waste hierarchy, towards the minimisation of waste production:
- 5. To protect and enhance the environment, amenity and human health:
- 6. To promote the use of sustainable transport:
- 7. To provide sufficient waste management facilities in a timely and sustainable manner, in order for all waste to be managed as near as possible to its source:

			Timescale		Commentary / Explanation
Proposed SA Objectives	Appraisal Criteria	Short Term	Medium Term	Long Term	(to include cumulative and synergistic effects as well as the differential
		(2010-2014)	(2014-2021)	(2021 – beyond)	effects on urban/rural environment)
5. To protect and enhance the quality of the sub region's controlled waters?	Will it protect and enhance the quality of the sub region's controlled waters? (inland, ground, aquifer, coastal, bathing, rivers and sea waters)	+	+	+	Objective 3.2.5 explicitly references the protection and enhancement of the 'environment' and the assumption has been made that this will include controlled waters in the Tees Valley.
6. To protect and enhance the sub-region's biodiversity and geodiversity	<ul> <li>Will it protect SSSI's, SPA's and SAC's and other statutory designated sites?</li> <li>Are opportunities taken in operation and restoration of waste and minerals sites to enhance biodiversity?</li> <li>Will it protect non-statutory (local) designated sites?</li> <li>Will it take into consideration species and habitats?</li> </ul>	+	+	+	Objective 3.2.1 and 3.2.5 both contribute towards this objective and reference the 'environment'.

- 1. To reduce the impacts of development on the causes of climate change and the effects of climate change on development:
- 2. To make provision for the adequate and steady supply of the minerals needed by society, whilst driving minerals supply up the minerals hierarchy:
- 3. To safeguard minerals resources from unnecessary sterilisation:
- 4. To drive the management of all waste up the waste hierarchy, towards the minimisation of waste production:
- 5. To protect and enhance the environment, amenity and human health:
- 6. To promote the use of sustainable transport:
- 7. To provide sufficient waste management facilities in a timely and sustainable manner, in order for all waste to be managed as near as possible to its source:

Proposed SA	SA Objectives	Appraisal Criteria	Short Term (2010-2014)	Timescale  Medium Term (2014-2021)	Long Term (2021 – beyond)	Commentary / Explanation (to include cumulative and synergistic effects as well as the differential effects on urban/rural environment)
the the	. To protect and enhance ne quality and diversity of ne rural and urban land nd landscapes	<ul> <li>Does it maintain and enhance landscape and townscape quality?</li> <li>Will it reduce greenfield development?</li> <li>Will it increase remediation of contaminated land?</li> </ul>	+	+	+	The objectives are development focused and seek to stimulate a variety of minerals, waste and transport facilities in the sub region. Although objective 3.2.5 ensures 'environmental protection' it is considered that this does not explicitly extend to the protection of greenfield land or sustainable use of previously developed land.  **Recommendation**  Objective 3.2.5 should include the sentence:-  All development should be located on previously developed land and assumptions made against any greenfiled sites usage unless in exceptionally or location specific circumstances.
t	8. To protect and enhance the sub region's cultural heritage	<ul> <li>Will it protect and enhance historic landscapes and features?</li> <li>Will it preserve and enhance heritage settlements and buildings?</li> </ul>	+	+	+	It is considered that objective 3.2.5 clearly addressed this sustainability criteria by making reference to the 'historic environment'.  **Recommendation**  The relationship could be marginally strengthened by the including the term 'cultural environment' into the body of section 3.2.5 to align with the sustainability objective and implying a social perspective to the criteria.

- 1. To reduce the impacts of development on the causes of climate change and the effects of climate change on development:
- 2. To make provision for the adequate and steady supply of the minerals needed by society, whilst driving minerals supply up the minerals hierarchy:
- 3. To safeguard minerals resources from unnecessary sterilisation:
- 4. To drive the management of all waste up the waste hierarchy, towards the minimisation of waste production:
- 5. To protect and enhance the environment, amenity and human health:
- 6. To promote the use of sustainable transport:
- 7. To provide sufficient waste management facilities in a timely and sustainable manner, in order for all waste to be managed as near as possible to its source:

	Appraisal Criteria	Timescale			Commentary / Explanation
Proposed SA Objectives		Short Term	Medium Term	Long Term	(to include cumulative and synergistic effects as well as the differential
		(2010-2014)	(2014-2021)	(2021 – beyond)	effects on urban/rural environment)
9. To reduce the causes and impacts of climate change	Will it reduce emissions of greenhouse gases?				Objective 3.2.1 explicitly aligns with this Sustainability objective.
	Will it reduce imports and exports of materials?				
	Will it reduce flood risk?	++	++	++	
	Will it reduce the loss of coastal resources due to sea level rises?				
	Will it increase number of renewable projects taking place in the Tees Valley?				
10. To reduce crime	<ul> <li>Will it reduce fly tipping?</li> <li>Will it reduce the use of unlicensed sites?</li> <li>Will it increase the use of 'Designing out Crime' principles on waste and minerals facilities?</li> </ul>	+	+	+	It is considered that all of the objectives contribute towards producing a minerals and waste industry in the Tees Valley that meets the needs of society thereby reducing social problems noted within this sustainability criteria. There are no objectives that explicitly relate to this objective although clarification under section 3.2.5 could produce a stronger positive relationship.  Recommendation  The relationship could be marginally strengthened by the including the term 'social protection' into the body of section 3.2.5 to align with this sustainability objective and implying a crime proportion personative to the criteria.
					implying a crime prevention perspective to the criteria.

- 1. To reduce the impacts of development on the causes of climate change and the effects of climate change on development:
- 2. To make provision for the adequate and steady supply of the minerals needed by society, whilst driving minerals supply up the minerals hierarchy:
- 3. To safeguard minerals resources from unnecessary sterilisation:
- 4. To drive the management of all waste up the waste hierarchy, towards the minimisation of waste production:
- 5. To protect and enhance the environment, amenity and human health:
- 6. To promote the use of sustainable transport:
- 7. To provide sufficient waste management facilities in a timely and sustainable manner, in order for all waste to be managed as near as possible to its source:

			Timescale			Commentary / Explanation
Proposed SA Objectives		Appraisal Criteria	Short Term	Medium Term	Long Term	(to include cumulative and synergistic effects as well as the differential
			(2010-2014)	(2014-2021)	(2021 – beyond)	effects on urban/rural environment)
	11. To improve and safeguard health and wellbeing while reducing inequalities in health	Will it ensure that waste and minerals sites are appropriately managed in order to reduce social isolation?      Will it increase the amount of recreational				Considered that aspects relating to human health are adequately covered under objective 3.2.1 and 3.2.5 in terms of appropriate management of sites and after use benefits for human health.
		facilities and open space?	++	++	++	
	12. To ensure high and stable levels of employment and economic growth in the	unemployment in the sub region?				It is considered that all of the objectives provide a framework for developing a strong, capable and sustainable waste and minerals economy in the Tees Valley that may also stimulate new jobs in associated industries such as transport.
	Tees Valley	Will it retain / create jobs in the minerals industry?	++	++	++	Objective 3.2.3 also implies that mineral resources shall be extracted prior to development on available sites to ensure maximise economic returns.
		Will it encourage social enterprise?				
		<ul> <li>Will it encourage clusters of related development?</li> </ul>				
		Will it increase the value of post industrial land?				

# <u>Is sue 2 – OBJECTIVES</u>

- 1. To reduce the impacts of development on the causes of climate change and the effects of climate change on development:
- 2. To make provision for the adequate and steady supply of the minerals needed by society, whilst driving minerals supply up the minerals hierarchy:
- 3. To safeguard minerals resources from unnecessary sterilisation:
- 4. To drive the management of all waste up the waste hierarchy, towards the minimisation of waste production:
- 5. To protect and enhance the environment, amenity and human health:
- 6. To promote the use of sustainable transport:
- 7. To provide sufficient waste management facilities in a timely and sustainable manner, in order for all waste to be managed as near as possible to its source:

				Timescale		Commentary / Explanation
Proposed	d SA Objectives	Appraisal Criteria	Short Term	Medium Term	Long Term	(to include cumulative and synergistic effects as well as the differential
			(2010-2014)	(2014-2021)	(2021 – beyond)	effects on urban/rural environment)
	13. To raise educational and training achievement across the sub region		+	+	+	There was a great deal of discussion around the scoring of this objective. None of the objectives make it clear that they will encourage educational achievement. However, on a cumulative level the new jobs created through the establishment of a successful minerals and waste industry will improve vocational training. To this extent a marginally positive relationship has been identified.
	14. To reduce the movement of materials and increase choice of transport mode	Will it encourage use of rail and port infrastructure?      Will it reduce the transportation of materials by road?	++	++	++	Objective 3.2.6 and Objective 3.2.7 specifically meet the aspirations of this SA criteria.

- 1. To reduce the impacts of development on the causes of climate change and the effects of climate change on development:
- 2. To make provision for the adequate and steady supply of the minerals needed by society, whilst driving minerals supply up the minerals hierarchy:
- 3. To safeguard minerals resources from unnecessary sterilisation:
- 4. To drive the management of all waste up the waste hierarchy, towards the minimisation of waste production:
- 5. To protect and enhance the environment, amenity and human health:
- 6. To promote the use of sustainable transport:
- 7. To provide sufficient waste management facilities in a timely and sustainable manner, in order for all waste to be managed as near as possible to its source:

			Timescale		Commentary / Explanation
Proposed SA Objectives	Appraisal Criteria	Short Term	Medium Term	Long Term	(to include cumulative and synergistic effects as well as the differential
		(2010-2014)	(2014-2021)	(2021 – beyond)	effects on urban/rural environment)
15. Access to waste and minerals facilities	<ul> <li>Will it reduce the need to travel?</li> <li>Will it increase the number of Household Waste Recovery Centres in the Tees Valley?</li> <li>Will it increase 'kerbside recycling initiatives'</li> <li>Will it provide more facilities for small to medium enterprise?</li> </ul>	++	++	++	Objective 3.2.6 and 3.2.7 specifically relates to achieving this objective.

Are the OBJECTIVES of the JMWDPD Appropriate?

- 1. To reduce the impacts of development on the causes of climate change and the effects of climate change on development:
- 2. To make provision for the adequate and steady supply of the minerals needed by society, whilst driving minerals supply up the minerals hierarchy:
- 3. To safeguard minerals resources from unnecessary sterilisation:
- 4. To drive the management of all waste up the waste hierarchy, towards the minimisation of waste production:
- 5. To protect and enhance the environment, amenity and human health:
- 6. To promote the use of sustainable transport:
- 7. To provide sufficient waste management facilities in a timely and sustainable manner, in order for all waste to be managed as near as possible to its source:

		Timescale			Commentary / Explanation
Proposed SA Objectives	Appraisal Criteria	Short Term	Medium Term	Long Term	(to include cumulative and synergistic effects as well as the differential
		(2010-2014)	(2014-2021)	(2021 – beyond)	effects on urban/rural environment)

#### Conclusions

The draft objectives scored significantly well against the sustainability criteria and on a number of occasions actually aligned with the broad strategic principles therefore having an optimum relationship. Notwithstanding this overall positive result, one negative relationship was identified between the draft objectives and SA criteria 7 and a number of other minor wording recommendations have also been afforded.

A negative relationship has been identified with objective 7 because it was deemed that the objectives are development focused and seek to stimulate a variety of minerals, waste and transport facilities in the sub region. Although objective 3.2.5 ensures 'environmental protection' it is considered that this does not explicitly extend to the protection of greenfield land or sustainable use of previously developed land. To this extent, and taking cognisance of the nature of the document it is considered that a marginally negative relationship is afforded as there is no explicit emphasis to encourage the use of PDL over greenfield locations.

#### Recommendations

Objective 3.2.5 should include the sentence:-

All development should be located on previously developed land and assumptions made against any greenfiled site usage unless in exceptionally or location specific circumstances.

The relationship with SA objective 10 could be marginally strengthened by the including the term 'social protection' into the body of section 3.2.5 to align with this sustainability objective and implying a crime prevention perspective to the criteria.

The relationship with SA objective 8 could be marginally strengthened by the including the term 'cultural environment' into the body of section 3.2.5 to align with the sustainability objective and implying a social perspective to the criteria.

**KEY** 

